

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (APPEALS) (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2013

APPEAL UNDER SECTION 47(2) OF THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997 BY DART ENERGY (FORTH VALLEY) LTD CONCERNING COAL BED METHANE PRODUCTION, INCLUDING DRILLING, WELL SITE ESTABLISHMENT AT 14 LOCATIONS AND ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE AT LETHAM MOSS, FALKIRK, AND POWDRAKE ROAD, NEAR AIRTH, PLEAN

(REFERENCES PPA-240-2032 AND PPA-390-2029)

PRECOGNITION BY DR TOM CROMPTON

ON BEHALF OF

**CONCERNED COMMUNITIES OF FALKIRK
(AND SUPPORTERS)**

Introduction

1. I have worked for some of the country's largest NGOs on cultural values, how they are shaped, and their importance in underpinning sustainable development. I have also worked with the UK, Scottish and Welsh governments on issues related to cultural values; have collaborated in research with some of the world's foremost academics working in this area; and have published widely on cultural values in both academic and popular journals. I hold a first degree in Natural Sciences (University of Cambridge, UK) and a Ph.D. in the evolution of altruism (University of Leicester, UK).

General outline

2. The aim of my evidence is to demonstrate that the values held by a group of people or communities represent quantifiable characteristics; that these values will be affected by people's experience of new developments; and that these effects are of practical importance in moving towards a more economically, socially and environmentally sustainable society.

Planning Policy relating to community identity and quality of life as aspects of sustainable development

3. My understanding is that the planning system should promote sustainable development. I have been directed to the National Planning Framework 2 (NPF 2) and Scottish Planning Policy (SPP) and I have drawn out those policies which seem to me to be pertinent to the aims of this evidence.
4. NPF 2 provides that "the fundamental principle of sustainable development is that it integrates economic, social and environmental objectives" (para 35). It continues: "the

planning system should promote development that supports the move towards a more economically, socially and environmentally sustainable society” (para 35).

5. The importance of place for identity is also emphasized in NPF2, drawing out the quality of cultural life as an asset amongst others, for example: “Successful places have strong, positive identities. They are cosmopolitan, well-connected and diverse, offering opportunities for a wide range of creative interaction. The environmental quality, built heritage and cultural life of Scotland’s cities and towns are therefore strong economic assets and planning policies must place emphasis on supporting and enhancing them.” (NPF2, para 13)
6. The SPP provides that the Scottish Government supports the five guiding principles of sustainable development set out in the UK’s shared framework for sustainable development (Para 35). Four of these guiding principles relate to achieving a sustainable economy, living within environmental limits, promoting good governance and using science responsibly. The other guiding principle is “Ensuring a Strong Healthy and Just Society”, which is explained to mean “meeting the diverse needs of all people in existing and future communities, promoting personal well-being, social cohesion and inclusion, and creating equal opportunity for all.”
7. SPP also provides that the planning system should work towards “supporting the Scottish Government’s five strategic objectives and fifteen national outcomes” (para 3). One of these 5 strategic objectives is to “help local communities to flourish, becoming stronger, safer places to live, offering improved opportunities and a better quality of life”. Two of the National Outcomes are:
 - (i) We value and enjoy our built and natural environment and protect it and enhance it for future generations;
 - (ii) We reduce the local and global environmental impact of our consumption and production.
8. My evidence will demonstrate that human values are quantifiable; that communities flourish when importance is placed on particular values; and that changes in the social surround – including new developments – will have effects on these values, potentially frustrating the aims of sustainable development. Those values which contribute most importantly to strong and flourishing communities are referred to as ‘self-transcendence values’ or ‘intrinsic aspirations’ (hereafter ‘intrinsic values’ in this document). Planning frameworks which authorize developments that engage intrinsic values will contribute to strengthening these values within a community. This is likely to have multiple benefits – leading to a commensurate strengthening of social and environmental concern among members of that community. Conversely, planning decisions which authorize developments inimical to intrinsic values, or developments which promote opposing ‘extrinsic values’, will contribute to undermining community cohesion, social and environmental concern and the wellbeing of members of effected communities.

How values are structured

9. A very large body of empirical research attests to the 'universal' structure of human value systems. This work establishes several key principles about human values, the way in which these are structured, and the nature of dynamic relationships between these (CCoF Docs 143 and 196).
10. Firstly, it seems that values are grouped, such that invoking one value within a 'group' is likely to invoke others in the same group. There are two groups of values which are of particular importance in the current context:
 - (i) *Intrinsic values*. These include values of community feeling, social justice and protection of the environment.
 - (ii) *Extrinsic values*. These include values of wealth, social power, social status and public image.
11. People for whom intrinsic values are more important tend to exhibit more pro-social and pro-environmental behaviour, and report higher levels of wellbeing. For example, a dispositional orientation towards intrinsic values has been found to be associated with lower ecological footprint. People for whom extrinsic values are relatively more important tend to exhibit lower motivation to engage in pro-social and pro-environmental behaviour, and report lower levels of wellbeing. They report lower levels of concern about a range of social and environmental problems (e.g. climate change) and are found on average to have higher ecological footprints.
12. These results are also found in the short-term. Thus, drawing a person's attention to intrinsic values tends to have the immediate effect of elevating social and environmental concern. Drawing a person's attention to extrinsic values has the opposite effect. These effects are found to occur as a result of very subtle value-related cues and they demonstrate what has been called the 'seesaw' effect. Elevate a person's awareness of extrinsic values and this serves to reduce the importance that this person places on intrinsic values, therefore depressing his or her motivation to behave in socially or environmentally friendly ways.
13. It has been found, for example, that asking experimental participants to reflect on different characterizations of their national identity leads to differences in the level of environmental concern that these participants subsequently express. When invited to reflect on their national identity framed in terms of entrepreneurship and wealth-generation, participants express significantly lower environmental concern than when asked to reflect on their national identity as characterized by family values and international co-operation.
14. Moreover, evidence suggests that values are learnt – that repeated reminders of particular values in the social surround leads to some values being strengthened in a durable, or 'dispositional' way – with predictable impacts upon individuals' social and environmental concern and reported wellbeing.

Values in Falkirk's Community Charter.

15. Falkirk's community charter is rooted in specific values. It construes Cultural Heritage in intrinsic terms. For example:

"We declare our Cultural Heritage to be the sum total of the local tangible and intangible assets we have collectively agreed to be fundamental to the health and well-being of our present and future generations. These constitute an inseparable ecological and socio-cultural fabric that sustains life, and which provides us with the solid foundations for building and celebrating our homes, families, community and legacy within a healthy, diverse, beautiful and safe natural environment. This is the basis of a true economy, one which returns to its root meaning (oikos - home, nomia - management)."

16. The values expressed in this charter are those more likely to be associated with environmental and social concern. To the extent that local initiatives and institutions invoke these intrinsic values – through the results of the work that they do, the way that they conduct this work, and the way in which this work is communicated within the community – social and environmental concern is likely to be strengthened. From reading the Precognition of Councillor David Alexander it seems to me that there have been local initiatives which have invoked intrinsic values such as those expressed in the Charter. The invocation of these values can be predicted to have had the effect of strengthening social and environmental concern.

17. Because of the antagonistic relationship between intrinsic and extrinsic values, experiences which engage extrinsic values are likely to contribute to increasing the importance of extrinsic values and serve to erode the importance placed on opposing intrinsic values. Any development which has the effect of engaging extrinsic values on an on-going basis is therefore likely to:

- Increase the dispositional importance placed on extrinsic values
- Decrease the dispositional importance placed on intrinsic values
- Decrease social and environmental concern
- Erode "Cultural Heritage", if this is to be established through the expression of intrinsic values (as seems to be the case with Cultural Heritage as defined in the Community Charter and in the Inquiry Statement).

18. Studies have found that drawing a person's attention to a non-natural (as opposed to natural) environment leads to a strengthening of extrinsic values, in turn associated with diminished social and environmental concern, reduced care for other people, and lower wellbeing. Developments which serve to change the nature of an individual's surroundings from natural to industrial are predicted therefore to erode the importance placed on intrinsic values. This, in turn, is likely to diminish an individual's environmental and social concern, and their commitment to their community.

19. Furthermore, developments which are 'imposed' upon a community – i.e. which are pursued against the will of a community - are likely to erode feelings of autonomy and self-direction. It has been found that when people experience less autonomy support, and more control from authorities, they are likely to orient toward extrinsic values. A

community's commitment to community cohesion and sustainable development is likely to diminish as a result of experiencing the imposition of such developments. Successful community mobilization against a development which is not considered by that community to be in their interest is likely to increase feelings of autonomy and self-direction. This, in turn, is likely to increase the importance that members of this community place on intrinsic values, entailing stronger commitment to community, and stronger social and environmental concern.

20. Another important and recurrent result from empirical studies is that sources of fear or insecurity tend to shift people in a more extrinsic direction. This has been found for a range of sources of insecurity, including economic, social and health insecurity. Heightened concern about economic insecurity is found to orient a person towards extrinsic values. Such orientations would be predicted to arise from concern about the negative impacts of a development on the value of a person's home, for example. Heightened concern about a person's health is also found to orient a person towards extrinsic values. Such orientations would be predicted to arise from concern about the health impacts of airborne and waterborne pollutants, for example. It seems reasonable to conclude that any development which heightens residents' sense of economic insecurity or concern about their health (irrespective of whether or not these fears are justified in terms of scientific assessment of risk) is likely to strengthen extrinsic values and diminish the importance placed on intrinsic values.
21. It is important to realise, therefore, that the impact of a development upon the values held to be important by members of a community will be different to the direct material impact. Developments which have little direct material impact on the environment may nonetheless have important impacts on the values held to be important by residents, thereby exerting significant indirect social and environmental impact as mediated by these values.
22. In summary, it is predicted that developments which (i) diminish the natural character of an area; (ii) erode a community's sense of autonomy and self-direction; or (iii) present salient and persistent sources of threat are likely to impact on community values in a way which is inimical to the aims of sustainable development.

Word count – 1953

18 February 2014